

Managing Our Disagreements	
Author	Hatem al-Haj - Master's in Islamic law (American Open University), PhD in Comparative Fiqh (al-Jinan University), M.B., CH.B. Equivalent to MD (Alexandria University Medical School)
	Human beings will not cease to disagree <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- "And if your Lord had willed, He could have made mankind one community; but they will not cease to differ"</li> </ul>
Types of disagreement	Ikhtilāf Taḍād - contradictory differences <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Most of the disagreements in the area of fiqh are of this kind</li> </ul>
Examples	Ikhtilāf Tanawwu' - differences of variety <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Various forms of the adhān and iqamah, various supplications at the beginning of prayer, etc.</li> <li>- Islamic groups and organizations having different focuses, such as da'wah, education, social reform, political activism, etc.</li> </ul>
Wisdom behind ikhtilāf tanawwu'	A display of Allah's mercy, for people's strengths and zeal vary  To complement one another like the different pieces of a puzzle that complement one another
Ikhtilāf Taḍād	Some scholars said that if the jurists reach the degree of ijtihād their positions will all be right <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Something cannot be simultaneously halāl and harām</li> </ul> <p>The correct position is that the differing opinions of the mujtahids on an issue are not all deemed correct, as indicated by the ḥadīth:</p> <p>إِذَا حَكَمَ الْحَاكِمُ فَاجْتَنَهْ فَأَصَابَ فَلَهُ أَجْرَانِ وَإِذَا حَكَمَ فَاجْتَنَهْ فَأَخْطَأَ فَلَهُ أَجْرٌ وَاحِدٌ</p>
Levels of ikhtilāf taḍād	Between religions - disagreement over the oneness of Allah and the prophethood of Muhammad ﷺ  Between different muslim sects - traditions reported by the Sunnah are not accepted by the Shiites, and vice versa  Within Ahl al-Sunnah - differences could be in matters of 'aqīdah (belief) or fiqh (practice)  Sunnah versus Bid'ah - examples are the various innovations in belief, such as the claim that the Prophet is made from light, the deceased can help their invokers, that the awliyā' (Allāh's friends) are better than the prophets, etc.  Correct versus Incorrect - taking the suitable approach to interpreting the revelation, in general, yet arriving at different conclusions

Excusable versus inexcusable differences	<p>Differences are excusable if they are not in the principles and foundations of faith and practice</p> <p>Excusable differences do not contradict un-abrogated authentic revelation and clear, confirmed consensus (ijma')</p> <p>Excusable differences must have some substantiation in the revelation and they must be upheld by some mujtahids</p>
Ibn Taymiyyah	<p>"Whoever disagrees with the clear and decisive verses of the Qur'ān and the established wellknown Sunnah or that which the Salaf of the Ummah agreed on with an inexcusable position, concerning which there is no excuse for him, then he will be treated like the people of innovations are"</p> <p>من خالف الكتاب المستبين والسنة المستفيضة أو ما أجمع عليه سلف الأمة خلافا لا يعذر فيه فهذا يعامل بما يعامل به أهل البدع</p>
Examples of excusable differences in aqidah	<p>The Prophet seeing his Lord.</p> <p>The degree of the infallibility of the messengers. Can they commit minor sins?</p> <p>Which was created first: the throne or the pen?</p> <p>The fact that the Companions differed over some matters of 'aqīdah is undeniable</p>
Examples of excusable differences in fiqh	<p>The obligation of rinsing the mouth and nose in wuḍū'</p> <p>The position of the hands after rukū'</p> <p>The obligation of niqāb for women</p> <p>The permissibility of meat slaughtered by the People of the Book without the mention of Allāh</p> <p>The permissibility of music</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Despite the weakness of the permitting position, it is still within the scope of excusable differences <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Does not include lewd or indecent songs <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Difference of opinion was only about the use of music alongside the recital of poetical verses that are also otherwise permissible</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul>
Excusable differences where opposing views are close in strength	<p>Unity or multiplicity of moon-sightings</p> <p>The obligation of the congregational prayers</p> <p>Reciting al-Fātihah for the ma'mūm</p>

<p>Difference of interpretation during the time of the Prophet SAW</p>	<p>When the Prophet ﷺ returned from the battle of Aḥzāb, he said to us, “None should offer the ‘asr prayers but at Bani Qurayzah.” Then, the ‘asr prayer became due for some of them on the way. Some of them decided not to offer the ṣalāt but at Bani Quraizah, while others decided to offer the ṣalāt on the spot and said that the intention of the Prophet was not what the former party had understood. When that was told to the Prophet he did not blame anyone of them”</p> <p>لَا يُصَلِّيَنَّ أَحَدُ الْعَصْرِ إِلَّا فِي بَنِي قُرَيْظَةَ... فَذَكَرَ ذَلِكَ لِلنَّبِيِّ ﷺ فَلَمْ يُعَنْفَ وَاحِدًا مِنْهُمْ</p>
<p>Differences being a mercy</p>	<p>Ibn Taymiyyah: “The scholars’ consensus is a definitive proof, and their divergence of opinion is a vast mercy”</p> <p>إجماعهم حجة قاطعة واختلافهم رحمة واسعة</p> <p>‘Umar ibn ‘Abdul-‘Azīz: “I do not like that the Companions of the Messenger of Allāh SAW do not differ (on an issue), for if they agree on one opinion, the people will be restricted. They (the Companions) are the leaders who are followed, and if a person were to adopt the opinion of one of them, it would be within his capacity”</p>
<p>Condemnation by a muqallid</p>	<p>A muqallid may not condemn another muqallid, except in matters of consensus amongst the scholars</p>

*AR*